

12-6-2016

Stafford, Katherine O. *Narrating War in Peace: The Spanish Civil War in the Transition and Today*.
New York: Palgrave, 2015.

William Viestenz
University of Minnesota

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.bowdoin.edu/dissidences>



Part of the [Film and Media Studies Commons](#), and the [Spanish Literature Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Viestenz, William (2016) "Stafford, Katherine O. *Narrating War in Peace: The Spanish Civil War in the Transition and Today*. New York: Palgrave, 2015.," *Dissidences*: Vol. 7 : Iss. 12 , Article 4.

Available at: <https://digitalcommons.bowdoin.edu/dissidences/vol7/iss12/4>

This Review / Reseña is brought to you for free and open access by the Journals at Bowdoin Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Dissidences by an authorized editor of Bowdoin Digital Commons. For more information, please contact mmcderm2@bowdoin.edu.

Stafford, Katherine O. *Narrating War in Peace: The Spanish Civil War in the Transition and Today*. New York: Palgrave, 2015.

Stafford, Katherine O. *Narrating War in Peace: The Spanish Civil War in the Transition and Today*. New York: Palgrave, 2015. ISBN: 978-1-137-50149-3.

William Viestenz
University of Minnesota

Katherine O. Stafford's *Narrating War in Peace: The Spanish Civil War in the Transition and Today* is a worthy entry into the canon of memory scholarship in contemporary Spanish cultural studies. What sets *Narrating War* apart is its innovative analysis of how the cultural production of particular authors and the reception of particular works of art, such as Picasso's *Guernica*, change signification and points of emphasis in the interim between the first years of the Spanish transition to democracy and the arrival of the twenty-first century and its attendant focus on the recuperation of historical memory. More precisely, Stafford chooses to isolate the periods of 1975-1986 and 2000-2013, given that "both were times when the conflict was intentionally and clearly revisited from a new political perspective, and these political changes imposed general revisions, reopening the debate" (15). The authors and works studied in the text are thus the control variables in an comparativist experiment in which narratives of the Spanish civil war shift over the course of the nation's forty-year post-dictatorship period.

Stafford argues that several key shifts have occurred in this time span, which all owe, to varying extents, to the emergence of hypermodernity. On the one hand, through this theoretical paradigm one sees a shift in emphasis in Spanish memory work from heroism to victimhood. In this transformation, prominent figures and the search for historical redemption through particular interpretations of the war are exchanged in favor of an increased spotlight on individual human lives and the abrogation of their rights and liberties at some point in the past. The second shift concerns the move from ideology to affect, or a lessened focus on "grand sweeping metanarratives" (6) and political compromise in order to highlight the visceral, sensorial reactions to the pain and suffering of others. The third hypermodern transformation concerns a move from trauma to identification. In this evolution, personal identity opens up as a conflictive, processional process where self-definition is an act of construction that takes place from both within and beyond 'sacred' institutional *lieux de mémoire*.

Stafford presents the hypermodern transfiguration of Spanish reception of the past cogently. However, *Narrating War* limits the paradigm of hypermodernity to "Spanish Civil War cultural production", an intellectual restriction that obviates considering how this aspect of the nation's collective response to crisis relates dialectically to other watershed calamities in twenty-first-century Spain. If, as the author argues, memory work in Spain begins in the new millennium to eschew politics in favor of affect, as well as grand political ideals in favor of hyper individuality, this is not the case elsewhere in responses to the economic crisis, beginning in 2008, and movements toward regional autonomy in areas like Catalonia, to name two prominent examples. Indeed, Stafford's analysis intermittently makes passing reference to both economic rupture and regional instability and shows the crises to not be isolated phenomena but rather related dialectically to memory production and processes of remembrance. The third chapter's analysis of "Guernica", for example, references students in the 15-M movement carrying a sign of the

painting. A similar imbrication occurs in the first chapter on Augustí Centelles's legacy and the political overtones as regards the destination of the photographer's archive. All of this is to say that as one works through *Narrating in War*, a question emerges as to what contingencies are required for the depoliticizing, hypermodern paradigm to fracture and allow for the reemergence of an agonistic politics that mobilizes broad constituencies and leads to the deindividuating creation of community. In this reassertion of conflict, are the affective and empathetic cornerstones of hypermodernity retained and mobilized?

Narrating War in Peace's first chapter interrogates the uses of photojournalism for memory as seen through the prism of Augustí Centelles's legacy. Stafford stresses that in the Transition period, Centelles's exhibits and photo-essay books tended to be inflected according to party ideology, with clear overtones of optimism and the redemption of past heroes. Stafford dedicates ample space to the first post-Francoist exhibit of Centelles's work in the offices of *Convergència Democràtica de Catalunya* in which Civil War heroes were especially spotlighted. In the new millennium, however, Stafford argues that Centelles's exhibits shift focus to "tragedy, disappointment, and victims" (46). Centelles's photojournalism thus transforms from a celebration of heroic values to an integral catalyst for the work of mourning.

The book's second chapter shifts focus to the production of moving images in an analysis of the filmmaker Jaime Camino. In addition to offering a useful narrative of the history of the thematization of the Spanish Civil War in fictional film, Stafford analyzes compellingly the evolution of Camino's work from the waning years of Francoism and first years of the Transition to the twenty-first century. In a close analysis of *La vieja memoria*, Stafford avers that the documentary differs in its "argument for the complexity of the past and human nature" as well as its "utter lack of conclusiveness and consensus, for the prominent presence of women, for the absence of a voiceover, and for its exploration of the side of the perpetrators..." (66). Any emphasis on affective response remains absent in *La vieja memoria* and the work is careful to respect the nuances and complexities of the Civil War, rather than resorting to a facile binary. Documentaries in the new millennium, according to the author, "are much more concentrated on the atrocities committed than on the ins and outs of the politics, events, or ideologies of the war" (83), and Camino's work is no exception. In her analysis of *Los niños de Rusia*, Stafford puts forth that the film is uninterested in politics (88) and driven toward nostalgia, sentimentality, and affect; "to produce emotion in the spectator" (89). The ultimate consequence of such a shift is the creation of a "dreamy, passive" audience that "does not create or stimulate many useful questions or analyses for today" (91). An unresolved tension, for this reader, is how an audience lulled into the passive reception of a 'good story' can be the same that translates "emotional concern for the victim" with "a new twenty-first-century hypermodern preoccupation with justice" (93). Indeed, it is doubtful that a public that has tired of politics and discarded an analytical critique of society will perceive a documentary to mimic a truth commission "and at times function as such" (86).

Stafford next turns her attention to the evolving cultural and political reception of Picasso's *Guernica* over the last several decades. In general terms, Stafford asserts that the painting was purported to be a symbol of reconciliation and hope in the first years of Spanish democracy. For this move to be made, the painting was compelled to fit the contours of "a unifying centralist reconciling national interpretation", against the exhortations of many in the Basque community

that attempted to link the work to Euskadi autonomy and history. Stafford argues that *Guernica* could not “have exemplified a new beginning and reconciliation had the painting been adopted as an exclusively Basque symbol” (119); it should be noted, however, that the precise notion of reconciliation is shown to be a chimera and beholden to a centralist, homogenizing ideology given that that a major segment of the polity objected to such a symbolic generalization. Stafford further argues that in the twenty-first century, *Guernica* maintains a “sacred connection to ritual, tradition, and ultimately, identity” (126), exemplifying the magical appeal that a *lieu de mémoire* purports to project.

The final chapter in the study tracks the evolution of the Spanish Civil War novel through a close analysis of Antonio Muñoz Molina’s *La noche de los tiempos*. The novel, like many other twenty-first-century memory narratives, references directly specific war events, features Republican protagonists, and recognizes the suffering of the defeated, but unlike other texts “mirrors a recent trend toward greater empathy and a wider denomination of victimhood” (130). In asserting that the novel challenges the readymade categories of victim, villain, and hero, Stafford makes effective use of the theoretical concepts of postmemory and metafiction.

In summation, *Narrating War in Peace* contributes to critiques of consensus-based reconciliatory politics in the transition period as well as the number of studies regarding the recuperation of historical memory in twenty-first-century Spain. Though its theoretical framework is at times inconsistent and muddled, Stafford’s work weighs in on two essential periods of post-Francoist Spanish life and is commendable for its multi-medial scope, including analyses of fictional and documentary film, photography, literature, and journalistic writing.