



IMAGES OF THE MADONNA AND CHILD  
BY THREE TUSCAN ARTISTS OF THE EARLY  
SEICENTO: VANNI, RONCALLI, AND MANETTI



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2015

OCCASIONAL PAPERS III

*Images of the Madonna and Child  
by Three Tuscan Artists of the Early  
Seicento: Vanni, Roncalli, and Manetti*

SUSAN E. WEGNER

BOWDOIN COLLEGE MUSEUM OF ART

BRUNSWICK, MAINE

Library of Congress Catalogue Card Number 86-070511

ISBN 0-916606-10-4

Copyright © 1986 by the President and Trustees of Bowdoin College

All rights reserved

Designed by Stephen Harvard

Printed by Meriden-Stinehour Press

Meriden, Connecticut, and Lunenburg, Vermont

## Foreword

THE *Occasional Papers* of the Bowdoin College Museum of Art began in 1972 as the reincarnation of the *Bulletin*, a quarterly published between 1960 and 1963 which included articles about objects in the museum's collections. The first issue of the *Occasional Papers* was "The Walker Art Building Murals" by Richard V. West, then director of the museum. A second issue, "The Bowdoin Sculpture of St. John Nepomuk" by Zdenka Volavka, appeared in 1975.

In this issue, Susan E. Wegner, assistant professor of art history at Bowdoin, discusses three drawings from the museum's permanent collection, all by seventeenth-century Tuscan artists. Her analysis of the style, history, and content of these three sheets adds enormously to our understanding of their origins and their interconnections. Professor Wegner has given very generously of her time and knowledge in the research, writing, and editing of this article.

Special recognition must also go to Susan L. Ransom, who edited the paper, and to Lucie G. Teegarden, associate director of public relations and publications, and Rachel D. Dutch, assistant director of public relations and publications, for editing and production of the volume. Miles L. Chappell, professor of art history at the College of William and Mary and a scholar of sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Tuscan art, kindly read the text; his support and suggestions are very much appreciated.

The James M. Fawcett III '58 Fund, the gift of a graduate who cared a great deal about the quality of museum publications, was used in support of this *Occasional Paper*. In 1981, the fund also supported publication of the *Handbook of the Collections of the Bowdoin College Museum of Art*.

*Katharine J. Watson*

Director

Bowdoin College Museum of Art

## Acknowledgments

THIS ARTICLE is based in part upon my dissertation on Francesco Vanni (Bryn Mawr, 1980). For their help in supporting the research that made this work possible, I would like to thank my advisor, Charles Dempsey; the Kress Foundation; Bryn Mawr College; and Bowdoin College. I am particularly grateful to Katharine J. Watson, director of the Bowdoin College Museum of Art, for her continued support and encouragement in all phases of this project. My gratitude also goes to my many colleagues who generously read drafts of this article, especially to Miles L. Chappell for his numerous helpful comments.

*S. E. Wegner*

## *List of Illustrations*

- 1 Francesco Vanni, *The Holy Family with St. John*, Bowdoin College Museum of Art, Bequest of James Bowdoin III, 1811.9 recto
- 2 Francesco Vanni, *Madonna and Child with a Book*, Bowdoin College Museum of Art, Bequest of James Bowdoin III, 1811.9 verso
- 3 Francesco Vanni, *Woman with Child and Other Figures*, drawing for the *Fall of Simon Magus*, Siena, Biblioteca Comunale, E.I. 15/25 verso
- 4 Francesco Vanni, full compositional drawing for the *Fall of Simon Magus*, Siena, Biblioteca Comunale, E.I. 15/25 recto
- 5 Francesco Vanni, *Woman with Two Children*, drawing for the *Fall of Simon Magus*, Siena, Biblioteca Comunale, S. III. 9/56 verso
- 6 Francesco Vanni, *Beato Tommaso Nacci with a Putto*, Florence, Uffizi 1696 E
- 7 Francesco Vanni, *Madonna and Child with Saints*, Rome, Borghese Gallery (photo: I.C.C.D., Rome, E 42296)
- 8 Francesco Vanni, *Madonna and Child with a Book*, Naples, Picture Gallery of the Gerolomini (Bibliotheca Hertziana, Rome, D 12025)
- 9 Francesco Vanni, *Madonna della Pappa*, formerly Berlin, Gallery van Diemen
- 10 After Francesco Vanni, *Madonna della Pappa*, variant, Louisville, Kentucky, Collection of The J. B. Speed Art Museum, no. 70.11
- 11 Leonardo da Vinci, *Madonna and Child with Saint Anne and the Lamb*, Paris, Louvre (Cliché des Musées Nationaux-Paris)
- 12 Leonardo da Vinci, *Cartoon for a Virgin, Child, and St. Anne*, London, National Gallery (Reproduced by courtesy of the Trustees, The National Gallery, London)
- 13 Raphael, *Bridgewater Madonna*, Duke of Sutherland Collection on loan to the National Gallery of Scotland, Edinburgh
- 14 Raphael, *Studies of the Virgin and Child*, London, British Museum, reproduced by courtesy of the Trustees of the British Museum

- 15 Cristofano Roncalli, *Madonna and Child with St. John*, Bowdoin College Museum of Art, Bequest of James Bowdoin III, 1811.99
- 16 Cristofano Roncalli, *Madonna and Child with St. John*, Florence, Uffizi, 10081 F
- 17 Cristofano Roncalli, *Madonna and Child with St. Joseph*, Rome, Borghese Gallery (photo: Anderson-Alinari/Art Resource, New York)
- 18 Cristofano Roncalli, *The Holy Family with St. John*, Piacenza, private collection
- 19 Francesco Vanni, *The Return from Egypt*, Columbia, Missouri, Museum of Art and Archaeology, University of Missouri, 64.88
- 20 Here attributed to Rutilio Manetti, *Virgin and Child with St. Bernard of Clairvaux*, Bowdoin College Museum of Art, Museum Purchase, 1982.12
- 21 Francesco Vanni, *Coronation of the Madonna in the Clouds, Immaculate Conception*, Paris, Louvre, no. 1955 (Cliché des Musées Nationaux-Paris)
- 22 After Francesco Vanni, *Coronation of the Madonna in the Clouds, Immaculate Conception*, Bowdoin College Museum of Art, 1935.914
- 23 Rutilio Manetti, *Blessed Margherita and Christ*, Florence, Certosa (photo: G.F.S.G., Florence)
- 24 Rutilio Manetti, *Immaculate Conception with St. Jude and St. Charles Borromeo*, Massa Marittima, Duomo
- 25 Rutilio Manetti, *Susanna and the Elders*, Siena, Collection Chigi-Saracini (photo: Soprintendenza B.A.S. Siena)
- 26 Rutilio Manetti, *Rest on the Flight into Egypt*, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Bequest of Walter C. Baker, 1971 (1972.118.259)





*Images of the Madonna and Child  
by Three Tuscan Artists of the Early Seicento:  
Vanni, Roncalli, and Manetti*

THE SIENESE PAINTER Francesco Vanni (1563–1610) was widely praised during his lifetime for his tender and affecting images of the Holy Family and of humble and reverent saints. His Biblical histories were lauded by many for their noble restraint and delicacy of color, form, and line. Today, however, the works of this early Baroque artist are well known primarily to specialists in early seventeenth-century Italian art, principally because most of his major altarpieces still ornament the churches of the Tuscan hill towns for which they were made and thus are not available to a wide audience. But if Vanni's fame as a painter and colorist has faded with time, his standing as one of the consummate draughtsmen of his age has risen. Hundreds of Vanni's lively pen sketches and softly blended chalk studies are known in private and public collections in Europe and America. Three drawings with old attributions to Francesco Vanni are in the Bowdoin College Museum of Art, and these drawings, their style, their history, and their content, are the subjects of this study.

Often drawings by other artists, especially contemporaries and followers, have been mistakenly attributed to Vanni. Innumerable anonymous drawings of religious subjects suavely worked in colored chalks or freely scribbled in ink were filed by dealers and collectors under the convenient label "Vanni." The painstaking process of disentangling Vanni's works from those of the other Tuscan draughtsmen active around 1600 continues. Close analysis, for example, reveals that only one of Bowdoin's three "Vanni" drawings can still be attributed to him. The others must be reassigned to two contemporary Tuscan painters: Cristofano Roncalli (1552/3–1626), an older artist from Pomarancio who studied in Siena in his youth, and Rutilio Manetti (1571–1639), Vanni's most talented and successful student.

The reassessment of these drawings is an appropriate occasion to present them in contrast to one another and to identify, through descriptions of style, motif, and technique, the minute characteristics which distinguish one master's hand from another's. However, this exercise of connoisseurship, delving into the minutiae of artistic individuality, is only one way to approach these works. They also share a common theme, the Madonna and Christ Child, a deceptively simple subject containing a wealth of symbolic imagery. The iconography of the Madonna embracing her son developed by Vanni, Roncalli, and Manetti rests upon the prototypes formulated by Leonardo da Vinci and Raphael almost one hundred years earlier. Thus, these three Bowdoin drawings illustrate the reform of Italian painting which took place around 1600. In part this reform was a reaction against the excessive artificiality and perceived decadence of late Mannerism. Reformers like Vanni believed that the art of painting had declined in the last half of the sixteenth century, and they looked back to the High Renaissance style of the early 1500s, carefully studying and emulating the clarity,

simplicity, and emotional directness of that age in order to redeem the art of painting for their own time.

The three drawings not only tell the story of artistic reform, but they cast light on the currents of Counter-Reformation devotion which encouraged it. In addition, the first two also give us insight into the taste of early American collectors. The Raphaelesque air of the figures may well have been the quality for which the Vanni and Roncalli drawings were included in the collection of James Bowdoin III in the late eighteenth or early nineteenth century. The Manetti drawing, discussed at the end of the paper, was acquired by the museum in 1982.

### *Francesco Vanni, The Holy Family with St. John (1811.9)*

VANNI'S DRAWING *The Holy Family with St. John* came to Bowdoin College with the bequest of the Honorable James Bowdoin III in 1811.<sup>1</sup> Even in the nineteenth century, this drawing in red and black chalk was connected with Vanni; his name was probably inscribed on the old mount, which is now lost.<sup>2</sup>

On the recto of the sheet (fig. 1) the monumental forms of the Mother of God and her infant son emerge from a network of flexible and mobile lines drawn in red chalk. Skittering lines evoke the crinkled folds of the Madonna's headdress and sleeve. Graceful arcs define the clean contours of brow, cheek, eyelid, eyebrow, and nape of the neck. The solid mass of the Madonna's figure is shown in three-quarter length. Firmly, deliberately, gently, she restrains and supports the body of the squirming child in her lap. Her majestic head tilts forward slightly and her expression is grave. Barely visible under the strong final idea for her head are the faintly drawn outlines of the head in another position. A few curving lines at the left margin of the sheet may mark part of another composition now trimmed off.

In contrast to the restraint of the Madonna, the young Christ is filled with movement. He reaches out to embrace his young cousin, St. John the Baptist, on the right. Active chalk lines describe Christ's hair, and his chubby legs sprawl across his mother's lap. While his body twists forward eagerly to reach St. John, Christ turns his head back anxiously to seek his mother's reassuring look. The light is from the left, illuminating these figures from behind. Old Joseph, set apart from this drama, is sketched at the upper right with a minimum of line. Three slashes and a flattened loop establish his features.

The verso of the sheet (fig. 2) records an earlier idea for the Mother and Child group. Here Vanni had not yet found the harmony that defines the Madonna's proportions and movements on the other side. The base of the composition, her solid, blocklike knees, is set, but her upper body is drawn with sharp-edged awkwardness. The sweep of curves that defines her form on the recto does not appear here. The child, less active than his counterpart on the recto, stands in a stooping contrapposto, clutching a book and looking back into his mother's face. The faces seem to be lit



1 Francesco Vanni, *The Holy Family with St. John*, Bowdoin College Museum of Art, Bequest of James Bowdoin III, 1811.9 recto



2 Francesco Vanni, *Madonna and Child with a Book*, Bowdoin College Museum of Art, Bequest of James Bowdoin III, 1811.9 verso

from a source to the right rather than from behind. Again, traces of a figure (a standing child?) are visible cut off by the left edge of the drawing.

Such images were Vanni's specialty. His artistic training and his own strong faith as noted by his biographers combined to make him a consummate painter of Madonnas. His particular genius matured just at the time when Counter-Reformation writers were encouraging a strain of religious art that emphasized quiet contemplation and mystic visions.<sup>3</sup> Vanni was born perhaps near Siena in 1563 and was taught the rudiments of his art by his stepfather, Arcangelo Salimbeni (active 1562–1580), a native Siennese artist of modest talent.<sup>4</sup> After Arcangelo's death, Vanni traveled to Rome, where he remained for about two years (1581–1583), studying the ancient marbles and the modern masterpieces, works by Raphael and Michelangelo. His teacher in Rome was Giovanni de' Vecchi (1536?–1614), a colleague of Federico Zuccaro (1540/41–1609), who would found the artists' academy, the Accademia di San Luca, in Rome in 1593. After a trip to Bologna and Lombardy around 1584 to study the works of Correggio, Vanni returned to Siena.

Vanni's attraction to the style of Correggio was probably inspired by his discovery of the work of Federico Barocci (1536–1615), an artist from the Marches renowned for his moving representations of the Madonna and Child. Vanni could have seen paintings by the reclusive Barocci in Ravenna, Arezzo, and Rome, and he had access to many of Barocci's other images through reproductive engravings and etchings. The undeniable impact of Barocci's sweet style strongly colored Vanni's early works of the 1580s, in which he achieved his first great success. Recollections of Barocci's emotionally charged color and exquisitely rendered figures continued to inform Vanni's art for the rest of his life.

Although he lived in Siena, Vanni maintained his connection with important Roman ecclesiastical patrons. A huge altarpiece, the *Fall of Simon Magus*, which he painted on slate for St. Peter's in Rome in 1603, was the crowning achievement of his career. Vanni's reputation, however, rested not on large historical works like this one, but rather on his smaller works of intimate subjects. His biographer, Filippo Baldinucci (c. 1624–1696) testifies that his works displayed "a high level of everything that is beautiful, everything one could desire in terms of drawing, invention, color, graceful heads, relief, and at the same time a certain nobility and grace that is completely delightful."<sup>5</sup> In his *Vite* of 1724, Nicola Pio mentions the "sweetness of the very beautiful air of the heads, so well animated and so exactly drawn" that pleased Vanni's patrons.<sup>6</sup>

The Bowdoin drawing, which displays the very virtues that Pio praises, may well have been done in preparation for a small devotional painting. While it cannot be connected with certainty to any known painting by Vanni, its affinity with drawings from the artist's hand supports the attribution to him. The rather free handling of the red and black chalks suggests the latter part of Vanni's career, perhaps around 1600.

During this period Vanni favored red chalk for figure drawings. In a chalk drawing (fig. 3) for the *Fall of Simon Magus* (Biblioteca Comunale di Siena E. I. 15/25 verso),<sup>7</sup> besides utilizing a similar medium, he showed the same tendency to repeat strokes of the chalk along garments and limbs, seeking to define the contours of the figure. The



3 Francesco Vanni, *Woman with Child and Other Figures*, drawing for the *Fall of Simon Magus*, Siena, Biblioteca Comunale, E.I. 15/25 verso



4 Francesco Vanni, full compositional drawing for the *Fall of Simon Magus*, Siena, Biblioteca Comunale, E.I. 15/25 recto

forms seem to quiver with the energy of living bodies in motion. In fact, the artist is searching for the best solution among many possibilities. In the Siena drawing, he shifts his line on the page as he strives to tune the proportions and positions of his figures. Similarly, the telltale loops on the lower left of the recto of the Bowdoin sheet (fig. 1) record the artist's adjustment of the Madonna's thumb as he shifted her hand back to grasp her son's leg. The same shorthand marks that establish eyes, noses, and hair in the Bowdoin drawing appear also in the Siena example. A single short, firm slash sets in dark eyes hidden under the curve of a brow. Quavering loops define eyes wide open and turning upward. In the Bowdoin drawing, the bodies of the protagonists are drawn lightly in black chalk, then affirmed by more decisive strokes in red. This same technique appears on another Vanni drawing for *Simon Magus* (fig. 4, Biblioteca Comunale di Siena E.I. 15/25 recto).<sup>8</sup>

The quality of chalk strokes, the way in which lines are multiplied along contours, and characteristic conventions for details of bodies in the Bowdoin drawing conform closely to those found in many drawings for the *Simon Magus* commission. Another preparatory drawing for that great altarpiece (fig. 5, Siena S. III. 9/56 verso)<sup>9</sup> even offers a very close parallel to the motif of embracing children found on the recto of the Bowdoin sheet.

On both sides of the Bowdoin drawing the position of the Madonna's head has been changed. The artist has drawn one idea on top of another. On the verso, the solution showing the head held back is more strongly drawn. On the recto, the face



5 Francesco Vanni, *Woman with Two Children*, drawing for the *Fall of Simon Magus*, Siena, Biblioteca Comunale, S. III. 9/56 verso

tilts forward, establishing a graceful line that outlines the nape of the neck and continues through the upper arm on the left. The initial idea on the verso seems to have been developed further on the recto, for the vestige of the head held upright remains in the gentle network of curving lines that forms the recto Madonna's head. Vanni experimented with two different positions of the head in just this way on Uffizi 1696 E (fig. 6), a drawing of the Blessed Tommaso Nacci.<sup>10</sup>

No known painted work by Vanni exactly repeats the composition of the Bowdoin drawing, but there are several works which bear comparison, all done in Vanni's maturity: the *Madonna and Child with Saints* (Borghese Gallery, Rome), the *Madonna and Child with a Book* (Church of the Gerolomini, Naples), and the *Madonna della Pappa* (formerly Van Diemen Gallery, Berlin). The composition of the Bowdoin recto (fig. 1) closely approximates that of the *Madonna and Child with Saints* (fig. 7), a small painting showing the Virgin holding the Christ Child on her lap.<sup>11</sup> Here Vanni completes the group not with the infant John the Baptist and St. Joseph, but with St. Catherine of Siena, St. John the Evangelist, and St. Francis. As in the Bowdoin sheet, the primary drama is between mother and son, who exchange glances. The second theme, the Mystic Marriage of St. Catherine, is relegated to the lower right. Like St. Joseph barely sketched into the background of the drawing, St. Francis and St. John look on from the shadows.

It is characteristic of Vanni's working method throughout his career that he strove in drawing after drawing to capture the precise postures and gestures that most expres-



6 Francesco Vanni, *Beato Tommaso Nacci with a Putto*, Florence, Uffizi 1696 E





7 Francesco Vanni, *Madonna and Child with Saints*, Rome, Borghese Gallery (photo: I.C.C.D., Rome, E 42296)



8 Francesco Vanni, *Madonna and Child with a Book*, Naples, Picture Gallery of the Gerolomini (Bibliotheca Hertziana, Rome, D 12025)



9 Francesco Vanni, *Madonna della Pappa*, formerly Berlin, Gallery van Diemen



10 After Francesco Vanni, *Madonna della Pappa*, variant, Louisville, Kentucky, Collection of The J. B. Speed Art Museum, no. 70.11

sively conveyed the emotions or actions of his figures. It is one of his strengths and at the same time one of his limitations that having formulated these inventions in which feeling or movement is perfectly crystallized, Vanni was not content to use them only once, but brought them back again and again in varying guises. These “signature figures”—the gallant halberdier seen from the back, the pious maiden with face uplifted toward heaven—are a hallmark of Vanni’s art. Thus, it is not surprising that the faces and forms on the Bowdoin sheet reappear in paintings of similar themes. The painting that shows the greatest affinity with the drawing, and the one for which it may well have been a preliminary study, is a small work on copper now in the picture gallery of the Church of the Gerolomini in Naples, the *Madonna and Child with a Book* (fig. 8).<sup>12</sup> In this work the Madonna looks to the left, but her full-cheeked face, bent down toward her son, who turns to meet her gaze, closely mirrors the one in the Bowdoin drawing. The proportions of the mother and child are much closer to those of the Bowdoin sheet (recto, fig. 1) than are those in the Borghese *Madonna and Child with Saints* (fig. 7). The intimacy and affection expressed in the painting, the limpid eyes and smiling mouth of the child, all have counterparts in the Bowdoin drawing.

The third comparable painting is the *Madonna della Pappa*, one of Vanni’s most celebrated compositions.<sup>13</sup> It is known in several versions, but only the one formerly in the Van Diemen Gallery in Berlin (fig. 9) seems to be autograph. One copy painted in reverse on copper (fig. 10) is now in the J. B. Speed Art Museum in Louisville.<sup>14</sup> The arrangement of the four figures in the painting is roughly equivalent to their



11 Leonardo da Vinci, *Madonna and Child with Saint Anne and the Lamb*, Paris, Louvre (Cliché des Musées Nationaux-Paris)

placement on the recto of this drawing (fig. 1), but the Christ Child is propped up on his mother's knee as on the verso. Both the painting and the drawing show events from the apocryphal accounts of Christ's infancy, subjects often explored by Italian masters of the High Renaissance.

These variations on the theme of the Madonna and Child all reflect in their classic beauty Vanni's sources in specific High Renaissance models. The Bowdoin drawing records the actual process of Vanni's reasoned investigation and use of earlier compositions. Many artists of Vanni's generation, intent on restoring the art of painting, which they felt had fallen into decay since the days of Raphael, consciously and avidly emulated High Renaissance models, especially works by Raphael, then regarded as the most perfect painter. Vanni's drawing in the Bowdoin collection is an ingenious reinterpretation of and comment on important works by Raphael and Leonardo da Vinci. Vanni recalls them subtly while maintaining the integrity of his personal style.

The verso (fig. 2), in which the standing Christ Child holds a book and looks back at his mother, shows a knowledge of Leonardo da Vinci's *Virgin and Child with Saint Anne and the Lamb*, now in the Louvre (fig. 11), which Vanni probably knew from one of the numerous copies in Milan.<sup>15</sup> The plump-faced child of Vanni's drawing grasps the book firmly in his fist; Leonardo's child grasps the lamb equally firmly by its ear and neck. The way the children turn their heads and clutch these objects is very similar. Vanni understood the complex posture of Leonardo's Christ Child. He had already studied and imitated the figure closely in another work, *The Consecration of the Church*, a painting in the monastery of Monte Oliveto Maggiore, probably done in the early 1590s.

This process of isolating a figure or a gesture from an earlier source—his own work or another's—and then adapting it in order to employ it in a completely new context, is typical of Vanni's working technique. It is also fundamental to the reform of painting and to the construction of a clear process of analysis and emulation that could be taught to students. It is probable that Vanni kept a "dictionary" of forms and gestures in drawings, prints, and copies of paintings for his own use and for use in teaching.<sup>16</sup> Judicious imitation of the best of nature *and* art was not seen as a weakness, but rather as a proper way for an artist to educate his eye and form a learned artistic judgment. In fact, part of the esteem showered on Raphael was based on the legend of his artistic training. The great biographer of artists, Giorgio Vasari, claimed that Raphael learned to imitate the styles of many masters and then combined their excellences to form his own most perfect style. Vasari's account of Raphael's training subsequently formed the basis for new programs of art education instituted in the late sixteenth century.<sup>17</sup>

On the recto of the Bowdoin sheet (fig. 1), Vanni has put this theory of the "combination of many excellences" into practice. He has transformed several different models, reconciling them through a masterful synthesis that is characteristic of his mature works. Drawing once again upon an influential design by Leonardo, Vanni presents his figures of Mary, Christ, and St. John as a harmony of closely interwoven forms, much like those in Leonardo's Burlington Cartoon, *Virgin, Child, and St. Anne*, c. 1499 (fig. 12). The lunging motion of Vanni's Christ Child is more energetic than



12 Leonardo da Vinci, *Cartoon for a Virgin, Child, and St. Anne*, London, National Gallery (Reproduced by courtesy of the Trustees, The National Gallery, London)



13 Raphael, *Bridgewater Madonna*, Duke of Sutherland Collection on loan to the National Gallery of Scotland, Edinburgh



14 Raphael, *Studies of the Virgin and Child*, London, British Museum, reproduced by courtesy of the Trustees of the British Museum

the action of the child in Leonardo's cartoon. It seems that Vanni modified his recapitulation of the Leonardoesque group with reference to a posture studied from Raphael's *Bridgewater Madonna*, ca. 1506–1507 (fig. 13).<sup>18</sup>

Most closely related to Vanni's solution, however, is a drawing by Raphael in the British Museum (fig. 14) in which the child twists in the embrace of his mother, one leg slung over her knee.<sup>19</sup> She grasps him gently by his extended leg and supports his upper body with her other hand as he turns to look back up at her. Vanni has altered the sources of his inspiration in that the Madonna's body in his drawing is not set in counterpoise to the child's. He has softened the suggestion of a struggle or restless movement. Instead, the bond between mother and child is heightened. The Madonna assists her son as he reaches to embrace his cousin, whose presence is a reminder of Christ's passion and sacrifice.

It is not possible to say with certainty how Vanni found access to the ideas of Leonardo and Raphael which he so skillfully evokes in his own works. Several painted imitations of Leonardo's famous cartoon would have been available to Vanni in Milan, including a *Holy Family* by Bernardino Luini in the collection of Vanni's friend and patron, Cardinal Federico Borromeo, archbishop of Milan. It is likely that Vanni's study of Leonardo through the works of his Milanese followers was greatly aided by Borromeo's collection and interest in Raphael.<sup>20</sup> By 1609 Vanni owned a painting by Raphael which he valued above all other works in his collection. This unidentified painting surely augmented what Vanni had already learned of Raphael's designs during

his extensive travels through northern Italy and to Rome, and through his study of reproductive prints made after Raphael's works. Vanni's paintings and drawings after 1600 are enriched with recollections of many Raphael compositions, including the *Bridgewater Madonna* (Edinburgh, National Gallery), *La Belle Jardinière* (Paris, Louvre), the *Entombment* (Rome, Borghese Gallery), and *Christ Carrying the Cross* (*Lo Spasimo di Sicilia*) (Madrid, Prado).<sup>21</sup>

### *Cristofano Roncalli, Madonna and Child with St. John (1811.99)*

JUST AS INFORMATIVE about the working methods of late sixteenth-century Italian draughtsmen is a second drawing (fig. 15), also from the 1811 Bowdoin bequest. The work was attributed to an unknown master and only recently to both Ventura Salimbeni and Vanni.<sup>22</sup>

The outline of the Virgin Mary in half length is drawn in red chalk on yellowed paper. She turns to the right to embrace her son, who strides toward her over the top of a low pier. The young St. John, drawn as a tousled child, looks on from the right. A third fat-faced infant occupies the lower left corner and points up toward Christ. Red chalk squaring covers the sheet except at the lower border, where the ruled lines are continued only by faintly sketched strokes. Squaring was a common method employed by an artist to transfer a design from one surface to another.

This drawing was made not by Vanni but by Cristofano Roncalli, called Il Pomarancio (1552/3–1626).<sup>23</sup> Born in Pomarancio near Volterra, Roncalli studied in Volterra, Florence, and Siena in the 1570s, finally moving in 1578 to Rome, where he achieved his greatest artistic successes.

Like Vanni, Roncalli was an extremely pious man, and he quickly affiliated himself with one of the new religious societies in Rome that encouraged lay participation. This Congregation of the Oratory, founded in 1575 by the avid Florentine church reformer Filippo Neri, proved to be very helpful to the advancement of Roncalli's career. For example, the Oratorians assisted the painter in getting a commission for an altarpiece for St. Peter's in the same series on which Vanni worked. Both Vanni and Roncalli were among those who developed Counter-Reformation iconography and style during the pontificate of Clement VIII. Roncalli's interest in early Christian archaeology and history was encouraged by his friend and patron, Clement VIII's church historian, Cardinal Cesare Baronio.

The Bowdoin drawing 1811.99 is a variant of a Roncalli drawing (fig. 16) in the Uffizi, 10081 F.<sup>24</sup> Both seem to date from the artist's early Roman period, around 1580/81. The Uffizi drawing includes three of the figures, lacking only the half-length child on the lower border. It also lacks the squaring and is realized in a much fuller chiaroscuro. The contours of the bodies are softened by parallel hatchings or smoky chalk shading rubbed into the paper. Roncalli created the Uffizi sheet to work out the system of lights and shadows on his figures. He made the Bowdoin drawing second



15 Cristofano Roncalli, *Madonna and Child with St. John*, Bowdoin College Museum of Art, Bequest of James Bowdoin III, 1811.99





16 Cristofano Roncalli, *Madonna and Child with St. John*, Florence, Uffizi, 10081 F

in order to transfer the essentials of the design onto another surface, perhaps a panel to be painted. Thus, both of these drawings are autograph versions of similar compositions, each created for a distinct artistic function.

Such pairs are well-documented among Roncalli's drawings. Two sheets showing St. Cecilia for the decoration of S. Maria in Vallicella, the Chiesa Nuova, Rome, have exactly this same relationship.<sup>25</sup> A fully modeled chalk drawing of the saint (Uffizi 692 F) was followed by a second preparatory study (Uffizi 10020 F) which is much more schematic than the first. It reproduces only the contours of the figure and is overlaid with the grid pattern of squaring for transfer.

In his explanation of Roncalli's working methods, W. Chandler Kirwin tells how the artist often started with one idea, then made many variations on it, often returning to his own earlier works for inspiration.<sup>26</sup> When Roncalli copied his initial idea from Uffizi 10081 F onto a second, slightly larger piece of paper, Bowdoin 1811.99 (fig. 15), he omitted much of the inner detail and included only the major contours of the composition needed for transfer. This summary drawing is evident in the drapery folds; for example, the lower edge of the Madonna's veil is rendered as a simple rounded shape. On the right hand border of the sheet, Roncalli left an important detail incomplete, making it difficult to interpret. Only a fragment of St. John's attribute, the little reed cross with a winding pennon, was drawn in above his left arm. This ambiguous passage in the Bowdoin sheet is clarified by comparison to the Uffizi drawing, where the staff is fully rendered.

When Roncalli made his duplicate drawing for transfer, he took the opportunity to experiment with a variation on his first idea by changing the position of St. John. In fact, the Bowdoin drawing shows two St. Johns; the fourth figure is not a little angel, but the boy saint rendered again. Both are identified by the reed cross carried in the left hand. The new idea for St. John is layered over the outline drawing of the Madonna's sleeve and the base of the pedestal. He is clearly an afterthought, yet his position offers a better solution to the group, a solution that contributes to the meaning of the theme. Now the pointing figure of the child prophet draws our attention to Christ: "Behold the Lamb of God." In Roncalli's first idea, Uffizi 10080 F, St. John points not at his cousin, but out of the picture entirely.

The Bowdoin drawing is an important link between the Uffizi *Madonna and Child with St. John* and two painted versions of this composition identified by Volpe and Kirwin. The Bowdoin drawing seems to have been a working study for the painting of the Holy Family and St. John in a private collection in Piacenza (fig. 18). This work includes the motif of the pointing St. John at the lower left, following the idea first articulated in the Bowdoin drawing. The fourth figure in the upper right of the painting is now St. Joseph, who turns his head inward to gaze at the embrace of mother and child. This onlooker, like the standing St. John in the Bowdoin sheet, completes a powerful diagonal from lower left to upper right which harmoniously balances the opposing angle of the Christ Child's body. The strength of the Piacenza composition encouraged Volpe and Chiappini di Sorio to label it an autograph version by Roncalli, dating to around 1610. A second painting in the Borghese Gallery which omits St. John (fig. 17) may be a simplified version of the Piacenza work.<sup>27</sup>

What both these paintings and the Bowdoin and Uffizi drawings share is the poignant embrace of mother and son. Christ presses his cheek against his mother's and wraps his arms around her neck. Roncalli took special pains with these closely juxtaposed faces, studying them carefully in another detailed drawing (Uffizi 10110 F). While this touch of face to face is intensely appealing and human, it may also reflect Roncalli's interest in the archaeology of the church and older forms of devotional images. There is a large class of icons of the Madonna and Child, the Eleousa type, known as early as the twelfth century in Italy, whose characteristic feature is just such an embrace.<sup>28</sup> Adaptations of this type appear often in the work of Ambrogio Lorenzetti and his circle, work with which Roncalli would have been very familiar from his student days in Siena.



17 Cristofano Roncalli, *Madonna and Child with St. Joseph*, Rome, Borghese Gallery (photo: Anderson-Alinari/Art Resource, New York)



18 Cristofano Roncalli, *The Holy Family with St. John*, Piacenza, private collection

## *The Infancy of Christ in Apocryphal Literature and Vanni's Art*

THE STORIES of the Holy Family's meeting with young St. John the Baptist and of their travels through the desert are not told in the Gospel accounts of Christ's life. Many of the incidents of Christ's infancy which appear frequently in sixteenth-century art are recounted only in apocryphal texts. Two of the most popular and widespread of these were the Gospel of Pseudo-Matthew (probably fifth-century) and the *Meditations on the Life of Christ* by the "Pseudo"-Bonaventura (second half of the thirteenth century).<sup>29</sup> According to the *Meditations*, the Holy Family encountered John the Baptist on their way back from Egypt, where they had fled to avoid Herod's wrath. On the edge of the desert, they found St. John already doing penance at a tender age. St. John received them with great joy and shared his simple meal with them as they rested.

The two Bowdoin drawings only allude to this narrative in the joyful greeting of St. John. The story unfolds more fully in another late composition by Francesco Vanni, a beautiful drawing (fig. 19) now in Missouri, *The Return from Egypt* (64.88).<sup>30</sup> The Holy Family emerges from a wilderness whose border is marked by a large date palm. Both the tree and the swarm of guardian cherubs sheltered in the overhanging fronds may have been inspired by Albrecht Dürer's famous engraving *The Flight into Egypt* (B. 89). In Vanni's drawing, Joseph carries the family's belongings and points to the kneeling St. John, who adores Jesus from the roadside. He is dressed in animal skins and carries a rude cross, marks of his hermit life. Even in this more elaborate narrative, the emotional essentials expressed so compactly in the two Bowdoin drawings are emphasized. The young Christ looks up with adoration at his mother, whom he leads by the hand. St. John's function, pointing out Christ's future sacrifice, is here underscored by other symbolic elements. Christ carries a basket filled with nails and pliers in one hand, a little bird in the other, both allusions to his Passion. In the foreground lie the bodies of three martyred Innocents, the children slain by Herod's men in their futile attempt to take Christ's life.<sup>31</sup> This work, like the two Bowdoin compositions, achieves its pious purpose by combining the tenderness of a mother's love with a melancholy foreboding of Christ's eventual sacrifice on the cross.

Stories and illustrations of the childhood of Christ were immensely popular in Catholic Italy of the late sixteenth century. Episodes of the Flight into Egypt and the Return were included in monumental cycles of Christ's life, such as in the nave frescoes in Santa Maria Maggiore in Rome. Even more common were smaller images, panels to hang on the side walls of chapels or to be used as private objects of devotion. It is not surprising, therefore, that pious artists depicted scenes from the Holy Family's travels which have no precise textual source.

One such example of this imaginative elaboration is Vanni's much beloved design, the *Madonna della Pappa*. In the version from the J. B. Speed Museum (fig. 10), Joseph, in his role as *nutritoris domini*, offers the swaddled baby a branch of cherries while an angel kneels before the Virgin and Child with a plate of fruit. Vanni's original idea (fig. 9) showed the angel holding a plate of gruel from which the Virgin scooped a generous spoonful for her son. This humble activity recalls northern domestic Madon-



19 Francesco Vanni, *The Return from Egypt*, Columbia, Missouri, Museum of Art and Archaeology, University of Missouri, 64.88

nas such as Gerard David's *Virgin and Child with a Bowl of Milk* (Brussels).<sup>32</sup> Perhaps the copyist responsible for the J. B. Speed version found the cereal too unusual and preferred to replace it with the more familiar plate of symbolic fruit.

The *Madonna della Pappa* (fig. 9) employs homey details and pleasing naturalism to connect the viewer with the Holy Family. In a convincingly childlike way, Christ smiles out at the pretty angel and at us as he curls one hand toward his mouth. Around his wrist he wears a protective amulet, a bracelet of coral beads. Such bits of coral were thought to protect young children from evil influences and are often seen in sixteenth-century portraits of children.

This idea of protection is reinforced by the figures of Joseph, Mary, and the angel, who encircle the child, shielding him from the dark wood and offering him sustenance. Vanni's image inspires pity for the defenseless infant and invites us to complete the circle of protection and offer what we can to the travelers. It is close in purpose to the text in "Pseudo"-Bonaventura's *Meditations*, which charges the reader to reflect on the difficult journey:

"He was carried to Egypt by the very young and tender mother and by the aged, saintly Joseph, along wild roads, obscure, rocky, and difficult, through woods and uninhabited places. . . . Have pity on them, for it was a very difficult, great, and long exertion for them, as well as for the child Jesus. Accompany them and help to carry the Child and serve them in every way you can."<sup>33</sup>

One last detail of Vanni's *Madonna della Pappa* points up the artist's inclusion of innovative imagery that underlines the religious significance of the scene. In most miraculous feedings of the Christ Child in the wilderness, the infant is offered fruit, usually the fruit of a date palm which has bent down to offer tribute. In this picture Joseph offers cherries, the fruits of paradise, which may also allude to Christ's eventual sacrifice and resurrection.<sup>34</sup> But the plate of cereal presented by an angelic servant is without precedent. Perhaps it was included to help link this moment in Christ's infancy with a significant event from Old Testament history, a device commonly employed by Christian writers, including the "Pseudo"-Bonaventura. According to the *Meditations*, the Holy Family was traversing the same dangerous wilderness that the Israelites had crossed centuries before. Perhaps Vanni extended this parallel in his painting by including the plate of cereal as a humble equivalent to the divine manna that fell from heaven to feed the starving Israelites.

### *The Taste for Raphaelesque Style in Eighteenth-Century Collecting*

THE CLEAR Raphaelesque connections in the Vanni and Roncalli sheets invite consideration of the currents of taste in eighteenth-century collecting as reflected in James Bowdoin's drawings. It is far more likely that these two works were chosen for their style than for their Christian subject matter.<sup>35</sup> Until more is discovered about the circumstances surrounding the acquisition of Bowdoin's collection of art, we remain uncertain of the motives for its creation. But what we do know about the tastes of other English and American collectors and connoisseurs of the eighteenth century suggests that the Vanni and Roncalli sheets were included in the drawings collection and valued as examples of the school of Raphael.

Appreciation for Raphael's art had always been high, but in the late eighteenth century his art was strongly championed by Sir Joshua Reynolds, first president of the Royal Academy in London. Reynolds cited Raphael as one of the supreme models for young artists, and in his Fifth Discourse, delivered to the students of the Royal Academy on December 10, 1772, he lavished praise on Raphael, lauding him for the "propriety, beauty, and majesty of his characters, the judicious contrivance of his Composition, his correctness of Drawing, purity of Taste, and Skilful accommodation of other men's conceptions to his own purpose."<sup>36</sup> Reynolds' ideas were well known in the United States and Europe, and the first two collected editions of the *Discourses*, published in 1797 and 1798, made the full printed texts available to a large and sympathetic audience on both sides of the Atlantic.

A serious amateur in the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries would have been interested in including Raphael's excellence in his collection. We do not know with absolute certainty when and by whom the drawings in the Bowdoin bequest were first amassed.<sup>37</sup> But if Bowdoin himself chose the works, he may have been influenced toward an appreciation of classicizing styles by fellow collectors. One such

collector with whom Bowdoin corresponded was President Thomas Jefferson (1743–1826), who himself owned a copy of one of Raphael's works.<sup>38</sup> If the drawings were initially acquired by the Boston artist John Smibert (1688–1751)<sup>39</sup> around 1720, nine years prior to his journey to the New World, some of the same impulses in taste may have been at work. Smibert's reverence for Raphael is documented by the painted copy of the *Madonna of the Chair* which he kept in his Boston studio as a classical model for his students. That copy is now lost, but another version after Raphael's *Small Holy Family* (Louvre) may have also been in Smibert's studio. Once owned by James Bowdoin III, and now in the Bowdoin College Museum of Art, it has recently been attributed to Smibert.<sup>40</sup> The precise connection between Smibert and the Bowdoin collection of drawings and paintings remains to be confirmed by documentary evidence. Perhaps a complete survey of the artistic character of James Bowdoin's collections would help to shed light on the process of their formation.

The collections as received by Bowdoin College do demonstrate an interest in Raphael's work. The demand for Raphael's style was filled by copies, prints, and drawings, and James Bowdoin III's collection included all three: the painted version of the *Small Holy Family* (1813.9); Ugo da Carpi's chiaroscuro woodcut (1811.72) of the *Death of Ananias*, after one of Raphael's celebrated cartoons for the Sistine Chapel tapestries; and several drawings from Raphael's "school." There exists no early nineteenth-century inventory of the Bowdoin collection of drawings, but old inscriptions on the mounts and on the works themselves indicate that the collection was thought to contain two drawings each by Polidoro da Caravaggio (ca. 1500–1543) and by Perino del Vaga (ca. 1500/1501–1547), important members of Raphael's *bottega*.<sup>41</sup> The collection also included the drawing by Francesco Vanni, who was described as a "follower of Raphael, one of the best painters of the decline," in the first catalogue of the Bowdoin drawings compiled by Frederick W. Hall in 1881.<sup>42</sup>

The subjects of Bowdoin's Raphaellesque painting, print, and drawings fall into the two classes of images preferred by early American collectors of Raphael's works: the great religious narratives and the "dear Madonnas." Vanni's and Roncalli's drawings share those qualities which endeared Raphael's Madonnas to American artists and collectors. Their serene expressions of maternal love recall the composition by Raphael most highly esteemed by amateurs and most often copied: *The Madonna of the Chair* (Florence, Pitti Palace). Both John Smibert, in his studio in Boston, and the American-born painter Benjamin West, in his studio in London, kept copies of this work as a source of inspiration.<sup>43</sup> It is perhaps not just coincidence that Benjamin West also owned a drawing by Francesco Vanni, the *Return from Egypt* (Missouri) discussed before. For collectors in the eighteenth century, buying a work by Vanni was a satisfying way to acquire an example of Raphael's style once removed. Whereas Raphael's drawings were rare and expensive, Vanni's existed in hundreds and were more readily available.<sup>44</sup>



20 Here attributed to Rutilio Manetti, *Virgin and Child with St. Bernard of Clairvaux*, Bowdoin College Museum of Art, Museum Purchase, 1982.12



*Rutilio Manetti, Virgin and Child with Saint Bernard of Clairvaux (1982.12)*

THE FINAL DRAWING to be discussed here (fig. 20) was not owned by James Bowdoin III. It is a new acquisition that complements the Vanni and Roncalli drawings because of its subject matter and attribution. When the drawing was acquired by Bowdoin College, it carried an attribution to Vanni, but it is instead proposed here as a work by Rutilio Manetti, Vanni's student.<sup>45</sup>

The drawing depicts a celestial vision of the Madonna. With rapid pen strokes and dramatic patches of brown wash over red chalk outlines, the artist has drawn the Madonna and Child enthroned upon a bank of clouds. The Virgin is crowned with a halo and a ring of stars that radiate a brilliant glory. Her son, whom she cradles on her lap, is also crowned, but his is a *corona radiata*, a halo of sharply pointed rays. The child holds in his hands three little mountains surmounted by a cross. An olive branch sprouts from each side of the mountains. Below the heavenly pair, a figure kneels on the ground. With his right hand, he points up to the mountains held by the child, and he carries a crosier in his left. On the ground in front of him stands a bishop's mitre.

This beardless saint dressed in a white habit appears to be St. Bernard of Clairvaux, one of the principal saints of the Benedictine order. He is sometimes shown with a discarded mitre to indicate that he declined a bishopric.<sup>46</sup> St. Bernard was the patron saint of the Blessed Bernardo dei Tolomei, founder of the Congregation of the Blessed Virgin of Monte Oliveto. The monastery of Monte Oliveto Maggiore, about thirteen miles outside of Siena, was founded in 1313 by Bernardo dei Tolomei. The three mountains, cross, and olive branches are the symbols of Monte Oliveto, for which this design may have been made.

The former attributions of the drawing to Vanni and to his stepbrother Ventura Salimbeni, as recorded in inscriptions on the drawing's mount, may have been made because of its religious imagery. Visions of the Madonna and Christ Child are numerous in Vanni's documented oeuvre, and the specific image of the Virgin crowned as Queen of Heaven is featured in several of Vanni's most famous compositions. One such design, disseminated through a reproductive woodcut made after a beautiful red chalk drawing now in the Louvre (fig. 21),<sup>47</sup> is also found in the Bowdoin College collection. This modest drawing (fig. 22, 1935.914)<sup>48</sup> by an anonymous copyist was probably made after the woodcut print which reverses Vanni's idea. It shows the Madonna receiving her sceptre and crown from her son, who perches on an orb held up by a child angel. A second angel holds the train of the Madonna, who kneels on the crescent moon set in a bank of clouds. Shown with some attributes of the Woman of the Apocalypse, she is "robed with the sun, beneath her feet the moon, and on her head a crown of twelve stars."<sup>49</sup> This apocalyptic imagery is not so strongly stressed in the wash drawing (fig. 20) of St. Bernard's vision of the holy pair. Instead the close and loving action between mother and child is emphasized.



21 Francesco Vanni, *Coronation of the Madonna in the Clouds, Immaculate Conception*, Paris, Louvre, no. 1995 (Cliché des Musées Nationaux-Paris)



22 After Francesco Vanni, *Coronation of the Madonna in the Clouds, Immaculate Conception*, Bowdoin College Museum of Art, 1935.914



23 Rutilio Manetti, *Blessed Margherita and Christ*, Florence, Certosa (photo: G.F.S.G., Florence)



24 Rutilio Manetti, *Immaculate Conception with St. Jude and St. Charles Borromeo*, Massa Marittima, Duomo

Manetti adopts Vanni's favored subject matter in the wash drawing (fig. 20, 1982.12). Indeed, Rutilio Manetti (1571–1639),<sup>50</sup> learned his early delicate Baroccosque style from Vanni in the first decade of the seventeenth century. As early as 1613 Manetti began transforming his style under the influence of Caravaggio's dramatic chiaroscuro and extraordinary naturalism. Manetti developed his manner of Caravaggism in the 1620s and had great success with it in his Sienese commissions for altarpieces.

The Bowdoin drawing appears to date from those early years of Manetti's exploration of a Caravaggesque idiom. The startling contrasts between the white of the paper and the dark pools of wash in the drawing parallel effects found in Manetti's paintings from the 1620s in which he experimented with the emotional impact of starkly lit forms. One example is the painting of the *Blessed Margherita and Christ* (fig. 23, Florence, Certosa) dated before 1621 by Bagnoli, which communicates the intense faith of the Blessed Margherita through the powerfully sculpted folds of her habit strongly modeled in light and shade. In the basic compositional structure as well—a kneeling figure below to the left and a celestial figure above to the right—this same painting recalls the Bowdoin sheet. This compact structure which electrifies the conjunction of material and spiritual worlds was often repeated in Manetti's works. His *Immaculate Conception with St. Jude and St. Charles Borromeo* (fig. 24) for the Duomo in Massa Marittima uses the device as one part of a more complex composition.

Manetti's repertoire of characteristic faces and postures provides another point of comparison between his documented works and the Bowdoin drawing. In his



25 Rutilio Manetti, *Susanna and the Elders*, Siena, Collection Chigi-Saracini (photo: Soprintendenza B.A.S. Siena)



26 Rutilio Manetti, *Rest on the Flight into Egypt*, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Bequest of Walter C. Baker, 1971 (1972.118.259)

*Susanna and the Elders* (fig. 25, Siena, Collection Chigi-Saracini), to cite just one example, Susanna's face, like Christ's in the Bowdoin drawing, is turned upward in an attitude of yearning. Both figures have the long throat and dimpled chin so common in Manetti's figures.<sup>51</sup>

Close comparisons with known Manetti drawings are less easily made because most of Manetti's identified drawings are done in different techniques; they are either detailed studies of models worked in chalks on blue paper or finished *bozzetti* in oil on paper. Ink and wash drawings are not unknown, however. A superb drawing (fig. 26), formerly in the Baker collection, now in the Metropolitan, shows a Madonna and Child in pen and brown wash with some red chalk, materials very similar to those of the Bowdoin drawing.<sup>52</sup> The haggard face of St. Bernard, the squat figure of the Virgin, and the coarse limbs of the Christ Child in Manetti's drawing seem far removed from Vanni's more ideal conception of the human face and form.

In fact, these two drawings (figs. 1 and 20) occupy opposite poles of style in devotional art in the early seventeenth century. Vanni's represents the idealized classicizing trend that sought to perfect nature, and Manetti's illustrates the more rugged style that drew from nature unperfected. Indeed, Manetti's cramped composition and unrefined figures suit his subject well. He shows us the Madonna and Child not as universal abstractions, but as protectors of a specific local congregation whose emblem they carry.



THE ATTRIBUTION of this last drawing, Bowdoin 1982.12, to Rutilio Manetti must still rest on present rather incomplete knowledge of that artist's graphic development. These arguments for Manetti's authorship must be continually tested against any newly discovered documents of his drawing style. With this *caveat* in mind, we may now look upon this group of three drawings, one truly by Vanni, one by Roncalli, and one by Manetti, and assess the usefulness of this reevaluation of them. By solving the question of attribution, by connecting the drawings with specific moments in each artist's career, and by pointing out nuances of subject and treatment, we have gained more precise understanding of the circumstances of their creation and the purposes for which they were created. These drawings have therefore become more useful documents in charting the development of early Baroque styles and in following an important current of Christian imagery. Seen together, these three images of the Madonna and Christ Child by three different Tuscan artists testify to the diversity of artistic experimentation at the beginning of the seventeenth century. They illustrate both the foundation of a serene Baroque classical style based on a renewed understanding of High Renaissance ideals, and—in the Manetti work—the germination of a more dramatic, emotionally charged style that was to dominate Italian painting for a century.

## Notes

- 1 James Bowdoin III was the son of the governor of Massachusetts, James Bowdoin II, after whom Bowdoin College was named. The younger Bowdoin was appointed by President Thomas Jefferson to serve as minister plenipotentiary to Spain from 1805 to 1808. Interested strongly in both the arts and the sciences, James Bowdoin III generously endowed Bowdoin College, granting it important bequests from his library and collections. The 141 drawings given to the College upon Bowdoin's death in 1811 make up the oldest public collection of drawings in America. For Bowdoin see Marvin S. Sadik, *Colonial and Federal Portraits at Bowdoin College* (Brunswick, Maine, 1966); Gordon E. Kershaw and R. Peter Mooz, *James Bowdoin: Patriot and Man of the Enlightenment* (Brunswick, Maine, 1976); and Robert L. Volz, *Governor Bowdoin and His Family* (Brunswick, Maine, 1969).
- 2 Red chalk over black chalk (recto and verso), 177 x 134 mm. (7 x 5¼ in.). Frederick W. Hall, *Catalogue of the Bowdoin Drawings*, MS, 1881, Bowdoin College Museum of Art, Brunswick, Maine, no. 15. Hall assigns authorship of the drawings solely on the basis of inscriptions on the old mounts or notations on the drawings themselves. *Catalogue of the Bowdoin College Art Collections. Part I, The Bowdoin Drawings*, ed. Henry Johnson (Brunswick, Maine, 1885), p. 9, no. 15; *Bowdoin Museum of Fine Arts, Walker Art Building—Descriptive Catalogue of the Paintings, Sculpture, and Drawings and of the Walker Collection*, 4th ed. (Brunswick, Maine, 1930), p. 65, no. 15; Edward J. Olszewski and Jane Glaubinger, *The Draughtsman's Eye: Late Italian Renaissance Schools and Styles* (Bloomington, 1981), pp. 97–98, no. 72; *Bowdoin College Museum of Art Handbook of the Collections*, ed. Margaret R. Burke (Brunswick, Maine, 1981), p. 166; Miami, Center for the Fine Arts, *In Quest of Excellence—Civic Pride, Patronage, Connoisseurship* (Miami, 1984), ill. 41, p. 51, p. 232; David P. Becker, *Old Master Drawings at Bowdoin College* (Brunswick, Maine, 1985), pp. 108–111, no. 50.
- 3 Important Counter-Reformation writers on art include Gabriele Paleotti, *Archiepiscopale Bononiense* (Rome, 1594) and *De Imaginibus Sacris* (Ingolstadt, 1594); R. Borghini, *Il Riposo* (Florence, 1584); and Federico Borromeo, *De pictura sacra libri duo* (Milan, 1624). For a recent discussion of this topic, see James Hall, "The Counter-Reformation and the Baroque Age," chap. 8 in *A History of Ideas and Images in Italian Art* (New York, 1983), pp. 297–340 and bibliography.
- 4 For a revision of Vanni's early chronology, see Susan Wegner, "Further Notes on Francesco Vanni's Works for Roman Patrons," *Mitteilungen des Kunsthistorischen Institutes in Florenz* 23 (1979), p. 314. The short biography given in Olszewski and Glaubinger 1981, p. 97, contains some inaccuracies. For recent important bibliography on Vanni, see: Peter Anselm Riedl, *Disegni dei barocceschi senesi (Francesco Vanni e Ventura Salimbeni)*, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi 46 (Florence, 1976); Peter Anselm Riedl, "Zu Francesco Vannis Tätigkeit für römische Auftraggeber," *Mitteilungen des Kunsthistorischen Institutes in Florenz* 22 (1978), pp. 313–354; Peter Anselm Riedl, "Bemerkungen zur alten Ausstattung von San Francesco in Siena," *Mitteilungen des Kunsthistorischen Institutes in Florenz* 23 (1979), pp. 325–336 (hereafter Riedl 1979A); Peter Anselm Riedl, "Francesco Vanni als Zeichner," *Münchener Jahrbuch der bildenden Kunst* 30 (1979), pp. 81–106 (hereafter Riedl 1979B); *L'arte a Siena sotto i Medici 1555–1609* (Rome, 1980), pp. 120–142; *Mostra di opere d'arte restaurate nelle province di Siena e Grosseto* (Genoa, 1979), pp. 217–228; Susan Wegner, *Francesco Vanni: The Emergence of a Counter-Reformation Painter*, Diss. Bryn Mawr, 1980; *Mostra di opere d'arte restaurate nelle province di Siena e Grosseto II—1981* (Genoa, 1981), pp. 175–184 and 210–212; *Mostra di opere d'arte restaurate nelle province di Siena e Grosseto III—1983* (Genoa, 1983), pp. 189–193 and 201–204.
- 5 Filippo Baldinucci, *Notizie de' professori del disegno da Cimabue in qua ecc.*, ed. Domenico Maria Manni, vol. 10 (Florence, 1771), p. 79: ". . . in alto grado tutto quel bello, che può desiderarsi, e per disegno, e per invenzione, e per colorito, per arie di Teste, per rilievo, e sopra tutto perchè nelle medesime spicca un certo che di nobiltà, e di grazia, che sommamente diletta."

- 6 Nicola Pio, *Le Vite di pittori scultori et architetti [Cod. ms. Capponi 257]*, eds. Catherine Enggass and Robert Enggass, *Studi e Testi* 278 (Città del Vaticano, 1977), p. 42: “. . . la dolcezza de sì bell'arie di teste così bene animate e per sì esatto disegno . . .”
- 7 Illustrated in Riedl 1978, p. 330, ill. 20.
- 8 *Ibid.*, p. 329, ill. 19 (BCS E.I. 15/25 recto).
- 9 *Ibid.*, p. 345, ill. 42 (BCS S. III. 9/56 verso).
- 10 Illustrated in Riedl 1976, ill. 9.
- 11 Paola della Pergola, *Galleria Borghese, I Dipinti*, vol. 2 (Rome, 1959), p. 56, no. 82, ill. 82 (Inv. no. 62). Della Pergola notes that the influence from Raphael is very strong and compares it to the Madonna in the Northbrook Collection in London. See also Martina Ingendaay, *Sieneische Altarbilder des sechzehnten Jahrhunderts, Studien zur Typologie und Thematik mit einem Katalog sienesischer Altarbilder von 1500–1620*, vol. 2, Diss. Bonn 1976 (Bonn, 1976), p. 641, no. 662.
- 12 Photograph in “Vanni, Francesco” artist file, Bibliotheca Hertziana, Rome.
- 13 For a discussion of this composition, its variants and preparatory drawings, see Riedl 1979B, pp. 87–89 and 102–103, n. 40. The version formerly in the Van Diemen Gallery in Berlin is illustrated in Cesare Brandi, “Francesco Vanni,” *Art in America* 19 (1931), p. 75 and ill. 6. Other versions are in the Louvre, in the gallery in Parma, in the Crowley collection in Florence, and in the J. B. Speed Art Museum in Louisville.
- 14 Museum Members Purchase 70.11, oil on copper, 10 $\frac{3}{8}$  x 7 $\frac{1}{2}$  in.
- 15 A partial list of copies and variants after Leonardo’s painting is given in *L’Opera completa di Leonardo pittore*, intro. by Mario Pomilio, notes by Angela Ottino della Chiesa, *Classici dell’arte* 12 (Milan, 1978), pp. 108–109, 115. One of Vanni’s patrons was Cardinal Federico Borromeo, archbishop of Milan. Borromeo’s visits to Siena and to Vanni’s studio are documented between 1601 and 1610. It is quite likely that Vanni visited Borromeo’s art collection in Milan. See note 21 below.
- 16 Vanni’s will describes the drawings, prints, models, and paraphernalia that he had collected with great care. The will requires that this collection be preserved intact for at least twenty-five years after the painter’s death, to be used as part of the training of his sons and grandsons in the art of painting. No complete inventory of the collection has been found, but a partial list of artists represented in the collection was made in 1609. See G. Bianchi Bandinelli, “La vita dell pittore Francesco Vanni,” *Bullettino senese di storia patria*, n.s. 49 (1942), pp. 86–87, n. 2 (for the inventory) and pp. 83–84 (for the will).
- 17 On the reform of painting, see: Charles Dempsey, *Annibale Carracci and the Beginnings of Baroque Style*, Villa I Tatti, The Harvard Center for Italian Renaissance Studies 3 (Glückstadt, 1977); Donald Posner, *Annibale Carracci: A Study in the Reform of Italian Painting around 1590*, National Gallery of Art Kress Foundation Studies in the History of European Art 5 (New York, 1971). On Raphael’s life as a model for artistic training, see Giovanni Battista Armenini, *On the True Precepts of the Art of Painting*, 1586, trans. and ed. E. J. Olszewski (New York, 1962), Introduction, p. 53; Mary Ann Graeve Frantz, “Taddeo Zuccaro as a Precursor of Annibale Carracci,” *Essays in Honor of Walter Friedlaender* (New York, 1965) in *Marsyas*, supplement 2, pp. 62–79; Anthony Blunt, “The Legend of Raphael in Italy and France,” *Italian Studies* 13 (1958), pp. 2–21.
- 18 John Pope-Hennessy, *Raphael* (Edinburgh, 1970), pp. 187–188, thinks that Raphael’s *Bridgewater Madonna* evolved from drawings he did after Michelangelo’s *Taddei tondo*.

- 19 Ibid., p. 179, ill. 163, British Museum Ff. 1–36. Another Raphael study for a similar mother and child group is in Vienna, Albertina 209r, illustrated in *The Complete Work of Raphael* (New York, 1969), pl. 41. A drawing in Windsor Castle now given to Cesare da Sesto collects on a single sheet the motifs of children embracing and a child climbing a lamb. Illustrated in David Alan Brown, *Raphael in America* (Washington, D.C., 1983), fig. 109.
- 20 Although Raphael is widely praised by writers on art in the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries, Cardinal Federico Borromeo, Vanni's patron, seems to have had special appreciation for the artist. In his *Musaeum* of 1625, Borromeo praises Raphael for the way he paints the head and upper extremities of the body, saying that he has preeminence in drawing eyes and vivacity of looks. Borromeo argues that Raphael's works should be copied, especially those in danger of being lost, so that they will be preserved for posterity. In 1626 Borromeo purchased Raphael's great cartoon for the *School of Athens* for his own collection. On Borromeo's writings and collection, see Arlene J. Diamond, *Cardinal Federico Borromeo as a Patron and a Critic of the Arts and His "Musaeum" of 1625*, Diss. U.C.L.A. 1974 (Ann Arbor, 1974), pp. 42, 96, 232–234; and Pamela Jones, "Federico Borromeo's Pinacoteca Ambrosiana," Diss. Brown 1983.
- 21 On Vanni's collection of art, see above, n. 16. Riedl has identified several of Vanni's debts to Raphael: drawings for an altarpiece of S. Torpè after a Raphael drawing now in the Louvre, Peter Anselm Riedl, "Francesco Vannis 'Gloria des heiligen Torpetes'," *Pantheon* 18 (1960), pp. 301–306; a drawing after Raphael's *Fire in the Borgo*, Riedl 1978, p. 344, ills. 40, 41; a Vanni drawing after figures in Raphael's Borghese *Entombment*, Riedl 1976, pp. 46–47, no. 35, fig. 37. Some other derivations from Raphael include a standing child after Raphael's *La Belle Jardinière* in a drawing for Vanni's *Fall of Simon Magus*, BCS E.I. 15/25 (illustrated in Riedl 1978, p. 330, ill. 20); and a striding figure of a soldier after Raphael's *Spasimo* in a drawing for Vanni's *Crucifixion*, S. Giorgio, Siena. The drawing is in the National Gallery of Scotland, Edinburgh, no. D4966v.
- 22 Red chalk squared in red chalk (recto), sketches in red chalk, writing in Italian (indecipherable) in red and black chalk (verso), 141 x 118 mm. (5 $\frac{5}{16}$  x 4 $\frac{3}{8}$  in.). Hall 1881, no. 80 (as Unknown); Johnson 1885, pp. 33–34, no. 82 (as Unknown); *Descriptive Catalogue* 1930, p. 81, no. 82 (as Unknown); modern attributions to Salimbeni and Vanni recorded in the museum file; Becker 1985, pp. 96–97, no. 44 (as Roncalli).
- 23 W. C. Kirwin in Miles L. Chappell et al., *Disegni dei Toscani a Roma (1580–1620)*, Gabinetto Disegni e Stampe degli Uffizi 53 (Florence, 1979), pp. 19–54; W. Chandler Kirwin, *Christofano Roncalli (1551, 1552–1626), an Exponent of the Proto-Baroque: His Activity through 1605*, Diss. Stanford 1972 (Ann Arbor, 1972); W. Chandler Kirwin, "The Life and Drawing Style of Cristofano Roncalli," *Paragone* 29, no. 335 (1978), pp. 18ff; Ileana Chiappini di Sorio, *Cristoforo Roncalli detto il Pomarancio*, I Pittori Bergamaschi dal XIII al XIX secolo, Il Seicento, vol. 1 (Bergamo, n.d. ca. 1980/81); *Mostra di opere d'arte III–1983*, pp. 184–188.
- 24 Kirwin in Chappell et al. 1979, pp. 23–24, no. 3, ill. 6.
- 25 Ibid., pp. 35–36, no. 14, ill. 15.
- 26 Kirwin 1978, pp. 334–337.
- 27 Chiappini di Sorio 1980/81, pp. 106 and 135 summarizes the arguments concerning the two paintings. Volpe and Chiappini di Sorio accept the Piacenza painting as autograph and label the Borghese work a derivative copy by another hand. Kirwin holds just the opposite opinion. See also Carlo Volpe, "Una precisazione sul Roncalli," *Paragone* 29, no. 335 (1978), pp. 87–90; and Kirwin in Chappell et al. 1979, pp. 23–24. I know the Piacenza version only from photographs, but it seems to be of higher quality than the stiff Borghese picture.



- 28 On the Eleousa type, see Victor Lasareff, "Studies in the Iconography of the Virgin," *Art Bulletin* 20 (1938), pp. 26–65. The Christ Child embracing his mother is also a longstanding symbol for the theological concept of the Marriage of Christ and the Church. In many of these representations, the Madonna, identified as Ecclesia Mater, holds or supports her Infant Bridegroom, Christ. See Marilyn Aronberg Lavin, "The Joy of the Bridegroom's Friend: Smiling Faces in Fra Filippo, Raphael, and Leonardo," in *Art, the Ape of Nature: Studies in Honor of H. W. Janson*, eds. Moshe Barasch and Lucy Freeman Sandler (New York, 1981), pp. 193–210.
- 29 Gospel of Pseudo-Matthew in *The Ante-Nicene Fathers*, vol. 8, eds. A. Roberts and J. Donaldson (Grand Rapids, 1951). See also Sheila Schwartz, *The Iconography of the Rest on the Flight into Egypt*, Diss. New York University 1975 (Ann Arbor, 1975). *Meditations on the Life of Christ: An Illustrated Manuscript of the Fourteenth Century: Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, Ms. Ital. 115*, trans. Isa Ragusa, eds. Isa Ragusa and Rosalie B. Green (Princeton, N.J., 1961), pp. 81–85; Bonaventura, "De reditu Domini ex Aegypto," chap. 13 in *Meditationes Vitae Christi*, vol. 6 of *Opera* (Rome, 1596), p. 360. The eastern apocrypha concerning St. John's childhood that entered Italian literature with the "Pseudo"-Bonaventura was further popularized by a vernacular *Life of St. John the Baptist* probably written in the early fourteenth century. This *Vita di San Giovanni Battista* brought together the many stories from the Latin tradition and added new details as well. See Marilyn Aronberg Lavin, "Giovannino Battista: A Study in Renaissance Religious Symbolism," *Art Bulletin* 37 (1955), pp. 85–101; and Marilyn Aronberg Lavin, "Giovannino Battista: A Supplement," *Art Bulletin* 43 (1961), pp. 319–326. F. P. Pickering, "Zur Ikonographie der Kindheit von Johannes dem Tauffer," *Anzeiger des Germanischen Nationalmuseums* (1981), pp. 21–27.
- 30 Museum of Art and Archaeology, University of Missouri, Columbia (Museum Purchase 64.88), black and red chalk, 271 x 184 mm., a study for Vanni's painting in SS. Quirico e Giulitta, Siena. Stephen Ostrow, "Some Italian Drawings for Known Works," *Muse* 1 (1967), pp. 22–25, 31–32; Riedl 1979B, p. 98.
- 31 This unusual addition to the Return from Egypt is seen more fully in the completed painting in the church of SS. Quirico e Giulitta, Siena, illustrated in Ostrow, p. 25, fig. 5; see also p. 31, n. 19. In that painting and in a painted copy illustrated in color in Piero Torriti, *La Pinacoteca Nazionale di Siena, i dipinti dal XV al XVIII secolo* (Genoa, 1981), p. 315, fig. 375, the bloody wounds of the martyred innocents are clearly displayed. The infant martyrs are crowned with garlands of leaves and flowers, and one holds the palm of martyrdom. I have found no literary precedent in texts concerning the infancy of Christ for the inclusion of the murdered children in this scene. Perhaps they were added to this painting as a link to S. Quirico, another infant Christian martyr who is patron saint of the church for which it was made. Francesco Vanni was an important innovator in devotional iconography, and this may be one more instance of his creation of new, symbolically powerful imagery. Guglielmo Della Valle, *Lettere sanesi sopra le belle arti* (Rome, 1786), vol. 3, p. 347 suggested that the three murdered children were included to demonstrate the impiety of Herod in ordering the massacre of the Innocents.
- 32 Illustrated in Charles D. Cuttler, *Northern Painting from Pucelle to Bruegel: Fourteenth, Fifteenth, and Sixteenth Centuries* (New York, 1968), p. 197, ill. 248.
- 33 *Meditations* 1961, p. 68.
- 34 On the symbolism of fruits found in works depicting the Rest on the Flight, see Schwartz 1975, pp. 91–94; Mirella Levi d'Ancona, *The Garden of the Renaissance: Botanical Symbolism in Italian Painting* (Florence, 1977), p. 90, suggests that the cherries offered to the Christ Child in some Italian paintings of the Rest on the Flight into Egypt are substitutes for the fruit of the date palm, which is not native to the cold northern Italian climate; a traditional late medieval English carol about Joseph and Mary,

*The Cherry Tree*, may be derived from the story of the miracle of the date palm described in the apocryphal Gospel of Pseudo-Matthew, chapter 20, according to Eric Routley, *The English Carol* (New York, 1959), pp. 50–53. On the symbolism of the cherry, see *Gods, Saints, and Heroes: Dutch Painting in the Age of Rembrandt* (Washington, D.C., 1980), p. 80.

- 35 However, drawings of the Madonna and Child or the Flight into Egypt do make up almost twelve percent of the original 141 Bowdoin sheets: 1811.4, 1811.5, 1811.9, 1811.25, 1811.30, 1811.31, 1811.32, 1811.33, 1811.42, 1811.45, 1811.46, 1811.47, 1811.51, 1811.52, 1811.61, 1811.99, 1811.102. Katharine Watson (in a public lecture September 19, 1983, cited in Becker 1985, pp. xv, xxi) has suggested that James Bowdoin III may have purchased the drawings and paintings intending to donate them as teaching materials to the college he was endowing in Maine.
- 36 Edmond Malone, *The Works of Sir Joshua Reynolds* (London, 1797) cited in *Michelangelo and the Mannerists: The Baroque and the Eighteenth Century*, vol. 2 of *A Documentary History of Art*, ed. Elizabeth G. Holt (New York, 1958), p. 278.
- 37 For Raphael's impact on early American collectors, see Brown 1983, pp. 15–28. For the appreciation of Raphael in eighteenth- and nineteenth-century Europe, see Claude Foucart, "L'Oeuvre de Raphael: Etapes et formes d'une critique littéraire," *Revue d'histoire littéraire de la France* 80, no. 6 (Nov.-Dec. 1980), pp. 1003–1025; Gerald Reitlinger, *The Economics of Taste: The Rise and Fall of the Picture Market 1760–1960* (New York, 1964), p. 5, speaking about the most highly prized painters in 1760, says, ". . . the name of Raphael was awesome and powerful. It was because Raphael had inspired them that the seventeenth-century Italians were so highly esteemed."
- For the most complete summary of the evidence and theories regarding the history of the Bowdoin drawings collection, see Becker 1985, pp. xiv–xv.
- 38 A letter from Bowdoin to Jefferson on March 22, 1805, published in Sadik 1966, p. 208, discusses the acquisition of a small copy of the famous antique statue *Reclining Ariadne*, then known as *Cleopatra*. This letter shows that Bowdoin and Jefferson did share an interest in classical style. On the prestige of the "Cleopatra" in the eighteenth century, see Francis Haskell and Nicholas Penny, *Taste and the Antique: The Lure of Classical Sculpture 1500–1900* (New Haven, 1981), pp. 184–187. On Jefferson's Raphael, see Brown 1983, pp. 23–25. On Jefferson as a collector, see Seymour Howard, "Thomas Jefferson's Art Gallery for Monticello," *Art Bulletin* 59 (1977), pp. 582–600; and *The Eye of Thomas Jefferson*, ed. W. H. Adams (Washington, D.C., 1976).
- 39 John Smibert was a colonial portrait painter who was born to a humble station in Edinburgh, received his artistic training in London and in travels through Italy in the 1720s, and finally settled in Boston by 1729, achieving success both as a portraitist and as an educator of young artists. On Smibert's collecting see Miles Chappell, "A Note on John Smibert's Italian Sojourn," *Art Bulletin* 64 (1982), pp. 132–138; Brown 1983, pp. 15–28; and Richard H. Saunders, "John Smibert's Italian Sojourn—Once Again," *Art Bulletin* 66 (1984), pp. 312–318. On James Bowdoin III as collector, see Sadik 1966, pp. 208–222; and Becker 1985, pp. xiv–xvi.
- 40 Brown 1983, p. 23 and fig. 8.
- 41 Attributed to Polidoro da Caravaggio were 1811.6 (now given to "Raphael School" in Becker 1985, pp. 68–71, no. 31) and 1811.14 (now given to an imitator of Giulio Romano in Becker 1985, pp. 219–220, no. 166). Attributed to Perino del Vaga were 1811.15 (now given to Friedrich Sustis in Becker 1985, pp. 28–29, no. 11) and the print 1811.72 (now recognized as Ugo da Carpi).

- 42 Hall 1881, no. 15. See Becker 1985, pp. xvii–xviii on Hall’s rediscovery and cataloguing of the drawings in 1881. Hall lists some of the printed sources he used in making his catalogue, among them Gustav Friedrich Waagen’s *Treasures of Art in Great Britain* (London, 1854), and works by Kugler, Ruskin, and Winckelmann, but his characterization of Francesco Vanni as a follower of Raphael was probably derived from the entry in *Biographie universelle ancienne et moderne* (Brussels, 1843–1847), vol. 20, p. 57.
- 43 Brown 1983, pp. 17–19, 23–25.
- 44 For an example of a British amateur’s collection of drawings, see A. E. Popham, “A Fair Sample of the Taste of an Eighteenth-Century Gentleman: The James Cavendish Album,” *Illustrated London News* (1952), vol. 2, p. 195. The Cavendish album includes a drawing attributed to Vanni, but it is probably not his.
- 45 Museum Purchase, Lloyd O. and Marjorie Strong Coulter Fund (1982.12), acquired from James A. Bergquist, Boston. Pen and brown ink and brown wash over red chalk, laid down, 191 x 153 mm. (7½ x 6 in.). Inscribed in graphite below on the right of the mount “V. Salimbeni”; inscribed in graphite on the back of the mount “Francesco Vanni.” Becker 1985, pp. 219–220, no. 170.
- 46 Louis Réau, *Iconographie des saints*, vol. 1:A–F, tome 3 of *Iconographie de l’art chrétien* (Paris, 1958), pp. 207–217.
- 47 Louvre 1995, red chalk, pink wash, 272 x 192 mm.; Riedl 1979B, pp. 89–90. For the woodcut after the drawing, see Hermann Voss, “Eine Grünewald-Fälschung des 17. Jahrhunderts,” *Cicerone* (1911), pp. 917–919; Otto Kurz, *Fakes: A Handbook for Collectors and Students* (New Haven, 1948), pp. 107–108; illustrated in Walter L. Strauss, *The German Single-Leaf Woodcut 1550–1600: A Pictorial Catalogue*, vol. 3: S–Z (New York, 1975), p. 1387, as Matthias Gerung (?). Vanni’s drawing does seem to show a knowledge of Albrecht Dürer’s prints of the Madonna as Queen of Heaven and as the Woman of the Apocalypse.
- 48 Charles Potter Kling Bequest (1935.914), pen over red chalk, squared in red chalk, 198 x 285 mm. Watermark: CB under fleur-de-lys (watermark not in C. M. Briquet, *Les filigranes* [Geneva, 1907]. Facsimile edition with addenda [Amsterdam, 1968]). Not listed in Becker 1985. The drawing bears an ostentatious inscription in ink: *Antonius Allegri Corregiensis fecit*, but the work has nothing to do with Correggio.
- 49 Revelation 12:1–6. The text goes on to describe her son: “And she brought forth a man child, who was to rule all nations with a rod of iron: and her child was caught up unto God, and to his throne.” In Vanni’s drawing the Christ Child delivers the sceptre to his mother and is seated on the orb of the world.
- 50 Alessandro Bagnoli, *Rutilio Manetti (1571–1639)* (Florence, 1978) (hereafter Bagnoli 1978A); Alessandro Bagnoli, “Aggiornamento di Rutilio Manetti,” *Prospettiva* 13 (1978), pp. 23–42 (hereafter Bagnoli 1978B); *Mostra* 1979, pp. 230–247; *Mostra II* 1981, pp. 214–217, 224–230; *L’arte a Siena* 1980, pp. 176–184.
- 51 For these works, see Bagnoli 1978A, p. 23 (*Blessed Margherita and Christ*) and p. 123 (*Immaculate Conception*). Seated figures in the paintings *Roger and Alcina*, p. 101, and *Birth of Mary*, p. 108, also resemble the Madonna in the Clouds in the Bowdoin drawing 1982.12.
- 52 Bagnoli 1978B, p. 37; Philip Pouncey, “Trois Nouveaux Dessins de Rutilio Manetti et une hypothèse pour Astolfo Petrazzi,” *Revue de l’Art* 14 (1971), pp. 68, 71 (n. 7), ill. 3; Jacob Bean, *Fifteenth- and Sixteenth-Century Italian Drawings in the Metropolitan Museum of Art* (New York, 1982), pp. 133–134.



# *Bowdoin College Museum of Art*

Katharine J. Watson

Director

Suzanne K. Bergeron

Secretary to the Director

John W. Coffey

Curator of Collections

Marilyn H. Dwyer

Receptionist/Shop Buyer

José L. Ribas '76

Technician

Helen Semerdjian

Clerk Typist

Henrietta M. Tye

Registrar

Marion M. Winkelbauer

Receptionist/Shop Buyer

Roxlyn C. Yanok

Administrative Assistant  
to the Director





